Academic Senate of College of San Mateo

Tuesday, August 25,
2:30pm - 4:30pm
Building 10-468
1700 W. Hillsdale Boulevard, San Mateo, CA 94402
Zoom
https://smccd.zoom.us/j/85146915715

Meeting ID: 851 4691 5715

Officers	
President	Daniel Keller
Vice President	Rene Anderson
Secretary	Yvette Butterworth
Treasurer	Makiko Ueda

Standing Senate Committee Chairs	
Curriculum Committee	Malathi Iyengar
Distance Education Committee	Julieth Diaz Benitez
Committee on Teaching & Learning	Rene Andersen

Division & Student Representatives	
Student Representative	Nicholas Costello (absent)
ASLT / Library	Lia Thomas
ASLT / Library	Susan Khan
Business/Technology	Vacant
Business/Technology	Kimberly Salido
Creative Arts/Social Science	Lee Miller
Creative Arts/Social Science	Maggie de Vera
Kinesiology/Athletics/Dance	Vacant
Kinesiology/Athletics/Dance	Mike Marcial
Language Arts	Tim Maxwell (left 3:40)
Language Arts	Vacant (Kat Webster)
Math/Science	Angel Pilar
Math/Science	Katryn Wiese
Counseling	Brandon Williams
Counseling	Jennifer De La Cruz
Enrollment Services and Support Programs	Daniel Rhyne (Zoom)

1. Opening Procedures				
No.	**Item / Description**	**Presenter(s)**	**Approx. Start Duration**	**Action?**
1.1	Call to Order (2:35) *Senate meetings shall require a quorum of the membership to vote on action items. A quorum for a meeting of the Senate and all Senate committees shall consist of 50% plus 1 of the committee's voting faculty members.*	President / Facilitator	~2:30pm 2 min	Procedure
1.2	Adoption of Today's Agenda (Motion to approve today's agenda Tim Maxwell & Maggie 2nd. Roll call vote: 15 Yes. 0 No. 0 Abstain.)	President / Facilitator	~2:32pm 2 min	Action
1.3	Adoption of Consent Agenda (Motion to approve Kimberly Salido, & Katryn Wiese 2nd. Roll call vote: 15 Yes. 0 No. 0 Abstain.) *All items on the consent agenda may, by unanimous vote of the Academic Senate members present, be approved by one motion after allowing for Senate member questions about a particular item. Prior to a motion for approval of the consent agenda, any Senate member, interested student, citizen, or member of the staff may request that an item be removed from consent to be discussed in the order listed, after approval of remaining items on the consent agenda.*	President / Facilitator	~2:34pm 3 min	Action
1.4	Approval of meeting minutes from March 24 and April 28, 2026 and May 15. (President Keller asked that only those present last year vote on these minutes and those who were not to please abstain. Motion to approve the minutes was made by Susan Khan & 2nd by Kimberly Salido. Roll call vote: 9 Yes. No. 6 Abstain.)	President / Facilitator	~2:37pm 2 min	Action
1.5	Public Comment (Lia Thomas discussed the Library's plans to propose an ad hoc Library Advisory Committee to the VPI to address concerns about the capital-project decisions affecting the library building and recent, sever budget cuts that have impacted library services and resources. This topic was flagged by discussion to be added as an agenda item later in the semester. Lia added that the Library Advisory Committee had formerly been a part of CTL, but had been removed from CTL, which is why they are proposing it be recreated as an advisory committee to the VPI. Maggie de Vera and Lee Miller praised all the hard work that has been involved in getting the AFT contract approved Tim Maxwell was asked by Elinor Westfold to make a request to faculty through the Senate that they come to the District meeting tomorrow, however the message sent by	Public	~2:39pm 6 min	Information

	the union says that we should no longer do this since we have a tentative agreement for our contract. Lee M. discussed the replacement of Mike Guingona as a Board of Trustees member representing Area 2. The AFT/the union had recruited a candidate, someone associated with Skyline, and faculty may get requests to help with phone banking.) ● Questions/comments on non-agenda items ● If more than one public commentator is present, comments may need to be limited to 1-2 minutes to accommodate everyone			
1.6	Highlights and Recognition (Maggie de Vera says that the addiction studies program numbers are growing and so far they have 100% pass rate at the state exams over the past 4 years. Maggie also highlighted that her "Chill Spot" ice cream shop won Best Ice Cream in San Mateo. She reiterated her earlier Senate invitation for Senators to stop in and partake of ice cream. Tim Maxwell recognized a former honors student, Pauline Tymchenko (from Ukraine), who led the SAGE Club (grew it to ~20 active members), spoke at the Bay Honors Symposium and the Honors Conference, and is now starting at Cornell. Maggie recognized the Senate's for the passion and sincere care the Senate members bring to the college and students. This sentiment was shared by President Keller and others.) • Share positive news about great things happening with our students, faculty, staff, and programs	Public	~2:45pm 5 min	Information
2. Standing Agenda				
No.	**Item / Description**	**Presenter(s)**	**Time**	**Action?**
2.1	Presidents' Report (This will normally be where committee meeting reports would reside. There have not yet been any committee meetings this semester, so President Keller highlighted some of the committees that he normally reports on and their upcoming scheduled meetings. Institutional Planning Committee (IPC) has been postponed until September. The first meeting would have been this week if not for the postponement. District Academic Senate (DAS) will meet the second Monday in September. The	Daniel Keller	~2:50pm 5 min	Information

	meetings are open to all. President Keller also serves on the Equal Employment Opportunity Committee, the AFT Workload and AI Committee, and the AFT District Teaching and Leadership Ethics Committee. He will report on these as relevant throughout the year. President Keller attended the June Board meeting where CSM was granted emergency funds to keep operations running smoothly. There was significant discussion and comparison between CSM faculty load and Canada and Skyline faculty load. This load discussion will be a recurring one during the fall. President Keller will also give ASCCC updates as needed.)			

2.2	Curriculum Committee Chair Report (Malathi Iyengar reported that the committee has not met yet. The committee's first meeting will focus on organization and training as obligated by law. The committee is nearly fully staffed, missing representation from only one division. A report will come in the next meeting.)	Malathi Iyengar	~2:55pm 3 min	Information
2.3	Distance Education Committee Chair Report (Julieth Diaz Benitez is Co-Chair with Jennifer Howze-Owens. They have not met. There is a new released update from the State for the OEI Rubric and that along with the associated training updates will be the focus of the committee.)	Julieth Diaz Benitez	~2:58pm 3 min	Information
2.4	Committee on Teaching and Learning (The committee is effectively paused while its scope is reconsidered. Historically handled SLO/ILO assessment, program review, and (until recently) professional development — the PD function was moved out of Senate because it serves the whole college, not just faculty; the same logic is now being applied to program review. Two staffing/structural problems triggered the pause: the PRIE Manager position was defunded, and the SLOAC (Student Learning Outcomes Assessment Coordinator) chair position — offered as a full-time faculty role — has drawn very little interest (one possible candidate as of this meeting). By comparison, Skyline has had one faculty member serve as SLOAC for 20 years as their full-time job. Deciding where the committee will "live" will be a major agenda item this semester.)	Daniel Keller	~3:01pm 3 min	Information
2.5	Student Representative Report (President Keller re-extended the invitation for Nicholas to join Senate. President Keller expressed hope he'll return next meeting.)	Nicholas Costello	~3:04pm 3 min	Information
2.6	Treasurer, Secretary & [Liaison Reports](#) (Nothing to report. There are two open liaison positions. We need a new Legislative & Advocacy Liaison since Emily has vacated that roll and the list serve has become quite active in recent months. We also need a Dual Enrollment & Rising Scholars liaison as Westly Hingano is no longer available to fill that position. The Treasurer's report was deferred to a future meeting. Background shared: the Senate had to change its bank account last year for a long list of reasons and it was "a bit of a nightmare". The Treasurer and President are working to re-establish **voluntary Senate dues** used for scholarships and other funding — this is expected to be resolved this semester.)	Treasurer, Secretary & Faculty Liaisons	~3:07pm 3 min	Information

	• CSM Faculty Dual Enrollment Liaison: VACANT • ASCCC CTE Liaison: Beth LaRochelle • ASCCC OER Liaison: On leave • ASCCC Rising Scholars Faculty Liaison: Wesley Hingano • ASCCC Legislative & Advocacy Liaison: VACANT • ASCCC IDEAA Liaison: Makiko Ueda • ASCCC Part-time Faculty Liaison: Maggie de Vera • ASCCC Credit for Prior Learning Liaison: Daniel Rhyne			
3. Senate Business				
No.	**Item / Description**	**Presenter(s)**	**Time**	**Action?**
3.1	**Orientation**: Welcome to the new academic year! We will introduce ourselves and briefly review basic Senate policies and procedures, including the 10+1, our bylaws, the Brown Act, and Robert's Rules of Order. (Please see the presentation. Introductions were first followed by the basic information. Daniel Rhyne a personal counselor from Veterans Resource Opportunity Center. Kim Salido from Cosmetology department in the Business and Technology division. Julieth Benitiz is an Instructional Designer and part of the Distance Education team. Maggie de Vera is the Director of Addiction Studies. Susan Khan is the Professional Development faculty coordinator. Lia Thomas is the Digital Services Librarian. Makiko Ueda from Personal Counseling Services is also the Treasurer of the Senate. Malathi Iyengar is an Ethnic Studies faculty and she is also the Curriculum Committee chair. Lee Miller is a Political Studies faculty. Daniel Keller has held many roles in the Senate and is currently the Senate President as well as English faculty. Rene Anderson is the Senate Vice President and English faculty. Yvette Butterworth is Senate Secretary and Math faculty. Katryn Weise is Earth Sciences (Geology/Oceanography/Paleontology) faculty. Mike Maciel is the men's Basketball coach and faculty in Kinesiology. Tim Maxwell is English faculty. Kat Webster is English faculty. Brandon Williams is Counseling faculty specifically EOPS counseling. Angel Pilar is Math faculty, MESA faculty advisor, Puente co-coordinator, and works closely with EOPS. Jennifer de la Cruz is Puente Counselor/coordinator, as well as a counselor for EOPS and Promise. Basic Policies & Procedures *(The Secretary's Nectir AI assistant helped to synthesize the secretary's notes and the audio transcript into the following summary of information. Additionally, a reader may find more information in President Keller's presentation on the Senate Website for the August 25, 2026*	President	~3:10pm 25 min	Information

	Meeting Agenda)
	• **ASCCC:** State-level advocacy organization. Fall 2026 Plenary will be in **Redwood City, November 5–7**.
	• **District Academic Senate:** meets 2nd Mondays, fall/spring, 2:15–4:30pm; rotates location among district campuses; open to all. Emails come from Todd Windisch, current District Academic Senate President (former CSM Senate President).
	• **CSM Academic Senate:** meets 2nd and 4th Tuesdays, fall/spring, 2:30–4:30pm; open to all.
	• **Subcommittees:** Curriculum Committee (2nd/4th Thursdays, ~2:15–4:30pm), DEAC (1st Wednesday, fall/spring), CTL (previously twice monthly; status currently undetermined).
	• **Governance structure:** Senate recommendations typically go to the District or to CSM administration. Example: last year's push to get budget information from CSM administrators. Items outside CSM's authority (e.g., changing exam-modality rules) usually have to go through the District. IPC (Institutional Planning Committee) is open to all, tri-chaired by the VP of Instruction, a Senate representative, and the Classified Senate chair; it oversees Finance, Safety, Educational Equity, Technology Advisory, and All-Campus Professional Development committees, plus occasional IPC ad hoc task forces reporting to the College President.
	• **AI features in Canvas:** A heads-up was given that new AI features have been added to Canvas without much advance notice; more information and a designated point-person for questions are coming soon (per Todd Windisch at the District level).
	• **The Brown Act:** Described as the core governing law for the Senate (passed in California in 1953). Key points:
	    ◦ All Senate deliberations and actions must be conducted publicly; minutes are always posted.
	    ◦ Agendas must be posted 72 hours in advance (in actual hours, not business hours) — President Keller posts them the Thursday before each meeting, plus a physical copy in the building.			

    - No secret ballots (the Senate did this once, years ago, and it "should not happen").
    - **Serial meetings / "hub and spoke" communications are prohibited** — this includes email threads reaching a majority of voting members (defined as 8 people for this body, including non-voting Executive Committee) discussing Senate business. Members were cautioned to avoid using Senate-wide email for anything beyond simple information-sharing; substantive discussion should happen in meetings.
    - Roll-call votes are required any time a member is participating via Zoom.
    - Quorum requires 8 voting members physically present.
    - Members with disabilities are exempt from standard remote-participation restrictions; accommodations are always available.
    - If there's a broadcast disruption (e.g., a past Zoom-bombing incident), the meeting is generally supposed to be shut down, though there is some flexibility if the Zoom attendees are only listening/presenting rather than voting.
    - CSM Senate is considered a "subsidiary body" (it doesn't make state law), so some of the stricter individual disclosure requirements that apply to legislators don't apply here.
    - Absences: a limit of **5 total meeting absences per year** was discussed and adopted as the working guideline (this "had some debate").
- **Robert's Rules of Order:** Recommended but **never formally adopted** by this body — a member (Malathi Iyengar) specifically asked whether the Senate had formally adopted Robert's Rules; confirmed no, though it's used as a loose recommended framework. President Keller walked through:
    - Motions require a second to proceed; without a second, the motion dies.
    - A member can introduce a motion just to enable discussion, without personally being committed to it.

	• New action items should generally be discussed at one meeting before being voted on at a later meeting (exceptions exist for genuine emergencies — e.g., a past vote to help save a threatened campus program was handled in a single meeting). • Amendments: any member may propose an amendment to a motion (not just the "friendly amendment" concept used in some formal bodies), as long as it doesn't completely defeat the original motion's intent. • **Point of order:** used to flag a genuine problem (e.g., a bylaws violation or a personal attack) — doesn't require a second; the chair rules on it, and that ruling can be appealed and put to a vote. • **Extending time** on a discussion requires a **two-thirds vote**, not a simple majority (done previously, e.g., to hear more from a visiting college president). • The chair's role is to facilitate, not to advocate; the Executive Committee (including the President) does not vote. The Student Representative gets an **advisory** vote only (recorded in minutes but non-binding).			
3.2	**Artificial intelligence and online classes:** We will begin discussing in-person final exams as one potential solution to the unauthorized use of AI in online classes. For background, please see the ASCCC resolution on the Senate "agendas and minutes" page. (*Background from the Secretary's AI synthesis of notes with audio transcript of the meeting:* Lee Miller raised this topic (having first mistakenly emailed the full Senate about it, which he was told violates Brown Act communication norms) to open discussion toward a possible future action item. He referenced an *Economist* article summarizing an academic study showing AI-using students spend less time on homework and score higher on assignments, but score worse on exams — deepening his concern that he cannot verify what online students are actually learning. Lee Miller would like to see permission granted for in-person exams for on-line classes (either at CSM or at supervised remote locations). His dean would not allow an on-line class to have an in-person exam. The Dean's solution was to change the course to a	President, Lee Miller	~3:35 pm 20 min	Discussion

	hybrid, but those are low enrolled and low enrolled classes can be cancelled. He noted this is "an arms race I'm destined to lose" against AI tools, and that giving grades that don't reflect real learning is a disservice to students and to transfer institutions (CSUs/UCs), some of which are increasingly rejecting online-only coursework. Maggie de Vera added her voice as another on-line teacher. She would like the option of having in-person tests with proctoring. Maggie took an exam for a test and the proctoring was very thorough and would like to see that rigor replicated in on-line courses here at CSM. David Locke brought forth the "OFI course option in the CSM Policy on Regular and Substantive Contact - Online with Flexible In-Person Content (OFI)" and provided the link: https://collegeofsanmateo.edu/distanceeducation/docs/CSM_Policy_on_Regular_and_Substantive_Contact.pdf He personally gave in-person exams for his online classes from fall 2015 through March 2020 — students could test with him, at the Learning Center, at a military base if stationed elsewhere, or at a UC if already transferred. He said this isn't a new idea — it went away, likely to protect enrollment numbers — and he would like to see it return, but his current dean does not allow it. Katryn Wiese is also 100% in support as we need to verify that the students are learning the material that we are saying that they are learning. More and more often the 4-year institutions are not accepting the on-line classes without in-person exams. Kat Webster added her support. President Keller added that the ASCCC is making a resolution about the policies for on-line testing. Tim Maxwell says that we have a lot of Dual Enrollment and we are giving credit where the rigor is not necessarily there either and feels this is the same idea. Julieth Diaz Benitez said that there are some new modalities that are being approved at the District Level, so maybe this is already been under discussion. Lia Thomas expressed concerns that there aren't a lot of proctoring services			

	available/affordable so we need to research proctoring more thoroughly. She also pointed out that international or remote students may not have access to proctoring options at all. Lee Miller asked about the current existence of Online with Fexible In-Person Content and if the dean of David's division allowing this. David confirmed that he can't do it and though he was able to at one point. Katryn brought up the problem that some students would need to be here at least once and that might not work, but all on-line students must reside in the state, though they may be traveling at certain parts of the semester. Malathi Iyengar discussed the technical/coding barrier — OFI is not a selectable modality in WebSchedule (only "online," "in-person," or "hybrid" exist), so instructors currently work around this by coding a class as "hybrid" with a single in-person meeting (the final exam day). This may explain dean hesitancy, since it doesn't require a new DE supplement but is a scheduling/coding limitation rather than a policy one. This doesn't solve the problem for students who can't physically come to CSM's campus at all on the exam day. Jennifer de la Cruz also raised a related, recurring problem: some instructors are scheduling mandatory in-person finals for otherwise-asynchronous online classes that conflict with students' other scheduled finals, effectively forcing students to choose between classes. President Keller confirmed this is a policy violation that should be reported to the relevant dean. President Keller noted a company is now marketing an AI-detection tool claiming "99.9999% accuracy" for **$20/student/month** — met with skepticism (compared to a "protection racket"); Keller had tested it/or similar tools informally and found they did not catch content he had personally written with AI and flagged others, like the US Constitution that were not written with AI. *Next steps:* This remains a **discussion item**, not yet an action item. Daniel Keller will follow up on: (1) whether the OFI modality can be made schedulable, and what the			

	actual blockers are; (2) available proctoring services and their feasibility; (3) coordination with DEAC on the modality-definition question, since ultimately any real fix likely requires a **district-level resolution**.)			
3.3	**Senate Goals for Fall 2026-Spring 2027:** We will brainstorm our goals for the coming year—see the "agendas and minutes" page for suggestions from flex day. (Some things of interest from last year and Flex Day session this year: • Compressed calendar (district level; unlikely to be implemented soon) • Continued Finance Committee updates on the budget • Student housing revisit with better preparation by the presenters for Senate questions on cost, library impact, and campus environment. • Clarification of state policy on burden-free (OER) instructions materials. A presentation is expected from Amy Mahoney. • Effects of AI on workload. An AFT workgroup currently exists and is open to any union member. A survey was implemented last Spring and will be discussed this Fall. • Full-time hiring freeze is currently in effect. A discussion has already begun about improving CSM's requisition/ranking process for future full-time faculty positions (potentially modeling Skyline's well regarded system). • President Keller met with the new VPI. Tim Maxwell expressed interest in a visit to Senate from the new VPI. • Clarification of SLO/ILO assessment practices and policies (via CTL). • Credit for Prior Learning policy discussion (via CPL liaison Daniel Rhyne). New items raised in this meeting (synthesis by Nectir AI with the Secretary's notes and audio transcript with additions of faculty contribution by the Secretary) : • **Commencement:** Concern (Tim Maxwell) that combining all three commencement ceremonies into one day last spring eliminated individual student recognition (no mention of accomplishments or organizations, just degree names) — worth revisiting. • **3-year DE training requirement:** Concern (Malathi Iyengar) that this **local** (not	All	~3:55 pm 35 min	Discussion

	state or district) requirement is preventing timely DE curriculum updates/supplement approvals; noted Cañada does not have the same requirement. • **More paid adjunct participation on Senate committees** — a recurring priority for President Keller; adjuncts are the majority of CSM faculty but the most underrepresented on committees. Maggie de Vera added her voice to the concerns over opportunity for adjunct faculty representation with pay. • **Registrar communication with faculty:** Katryn Wiese expressed concerns about lack of communication with the faculty before the changes to WebSmart occurred. There were other concerns expressed about final exams appearing as separate schedule line items confusing students (who think their class meets more often than it does), and about final exam scheduling/lab final exams being dropped without faculty input — e.g., one dean reportedly told a faculty member that "science labs shouldn't have finals," which several members found highly unusual. • **New Faculty Door Card system:** Faculty pages/course listings and office-hour info are no longer properly linked, making it hard for students to find instructor office hours. Lia Thomas added her voice in this conversation. • **General Education / Institutional-Level SLOs (ILOs):** Interest in a higher-level, cross-departmental conversation about outcomes like information competency and quantitative skills, rather than siloed departmental assessment (likely to surface via CTL). Susan Khan added her voice in this discussion. • **Disappearing waitlists, last date of attendance issues, time between semester end and grade due date** — carried on the list as items for later discussion. • Makiko would like to discuss the student conduct issue process.)			

4. Closing Procedures				
No.	**Item / Description**	**Presenter(s)**	**Time**	**Action?**
4.1	Final Announcements (None.) *President or facilitator elicits final announcements about upcoming deadlines, events, scheduling changes, etc.*	President /	~4:30pm 0 min	Information
4.2	Adjourn(4:33)	President /	~4:30pm	Procedure