

**Minutes of the Study Session of the Board of Trustees
San Mateo County Community College District
September 12, 2018, San Mateo, CA**

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 p.m.

Board Members Present: President Richard Holober, Vice President Maurice Goodman, Trustee Dave Mandelkern, Trustee Thomas Mohr, Trustee Karen Schwarz

ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION

President Holober said that during closed session, the Board will (1) hold a conference with legal counsel regarding three cases of existing litigation and one case of potential litigation as listed on the printed agenda, (2) consider ratification of confidential District warrants, and (3) consider employee discipline, dismissal, release.

STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS ONLY

None

RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION

The Board recessed to closed session at 5:01 p.m.

RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION

The Board reconvened to open session at 6:10 p.m.

Board Members Present: President Richard Holober, Vice President Maurice Goodman, Trustee Dave Mandelkern, Trustee Thomas Mohr, Trustee Karen Schwarz

Others Present: Chancellor Ron Galatolo, Executive Vice Chancellor Kathy Blackwood, Skyline College Vice President of Student Services Angélica Garcia, College of San Mateo President Michael Claire, Cañada College President Jamillah Moore

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ANNOUNCEMENT OF REPORTABLE ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION

President Holober announced that during closed session, the Board voted unanimously to ratify the confidential District warrants that were presented.

DISCUSSION OF THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA

President Holober said staff requests that item 18-9-1C, Update on District Strategic Plan, be heard immediately following Item 18-9-2A, Approval of the Allocation of Total Compensation and New Salary Schedules. There was no objection from the Board.

MINUTES

It was moved by Trustee Mohr and seconded by Vice President Goodman to approve the minutes of the study session of August 14, 2018. The motion carried, with Trustee Schwarz abstaining and all other members voting Aye.

It was moved by Trustee Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Mohr to approve the minutes of the regular meeting of August 22, 2018. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

None

NEW BUSINESS

APPROVAL OF PERSONNEL ITEMS: CHANGES IN ASSIGNMENT, COMPENSATION, PLACEMENT, LEAVES, STAFF ALLOCATIONS AND CLASSIFICATION OF ACADEMIC AND CLASSIFIED PERSONNEL (18-9-1A)

It was moved by Trustee Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Mohr to approve the items in the report. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

APPROVAL OF THE ALLOCATION OF TOTAL COMPENSATION AND NEW SALARY SCHEDULES (18-9-2A)

It was moved by Trustee Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Mohr to approve allocation and salary schedules as presented. David Feune, Director of Human Resources, said that in order to comply with Government Code 54953, staff will summarize the allocation and salary schedules. He said AFT voted to allocate their 2018-19 funds entirely to the salary schedule, resulting in a 4.02% increase for full-time faculty and a 5.02% increase for part-time faculty. These increases are reflected in the Regular Faculty Schedules 80 and OL and Adjunct Faculty Schedules AJ and HI. In addition, on July 25, 2018, the Board approved the CSEA allocation of available compensation and CSEA Classified Salary Schedule 60 for 2018-19. CSEA Classified Salary Schedule 62 was unintentionally omitted from the July 25, 2018 board report and is being included on this report for approval. The approved 4.17% increase, which was approved by the Board on July 25, is reflected in the Classified Salary Schedule 62.

Trustee Mandelkern asked if the proposed 2018-19 budget incorporates these changes as if they had been approved. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the dollars are in the budget but have not been allocated for faculty. The lump sum is in Central Services and will be transferred and allocated according to this agreement and will not change the bottom line. The allocations for CSEA, AFSCME and non-represented employees are reflected in the budget.

President Holoher asked if the allocations could potentially affect the 50 Percent Law because of the raise in salaries. Chancellor Galatolo said the 50 Percent Law is based on an expenditure model rather than a budget model and is therefore not contemplated in the budget. He said the 50 Percent Law is calculated on actual expenditures which change during the course of the year and are reflected at the end of the year.

After this discussion, the motion carried, all members voting Aye.

INFORMATION REPORT

UPDATE ON DISTRICT STRATEGIC PLAN (18-9-1C)

Aaron McVean, Vice Chancellor of Educational Services and Planning, said the focus of the presentation will be a discussion of the Strategic Plan and associated metrics, beginning with an overview of the metrics and targets for the District. The Colleges will then share efforts related to specific metrics, followed by a review of the Tableau Metrics Dashboard. Vice Chancellor McVean said the focus of the Strategic Plan is Students First: Success, Equity and Social Justice.

Vice Chancellor McVean provided an overview of the metrics:

- Enrollment of full-time, first-time students increased from fall 2016 to fall 2017, all attributable to Skyline College.
President Mohr asked how many first-time students attend full-time. Vice Chancellor McVean said the most recent data shows that 64% are full-time. President Holoher asked if the data disaggregates resident and non-resident students. Vice Chancellor McVean said it is disaggregated in the Dashboard.
- The percentage of students completing a Student Educational Plan continues to increase, along with content of the Plans.
- Fall-to-spring persistence – hope to increase as the number of full-time students increases.
- Percentage of initial enrollment in basic skills math and English vs. transfer level math and English:
Math – percentage in basic skills decreased to 17% in fall 2017 and percentage in transfer level increased to 48%
English – percentage in basic skills decreased to 3% and percentage in transfer level increased to 78%
Trustee Mohr, noting the 48% initial enrollment in transfer level math and 17% in basic skills math, asked where the remainder of students are placed. Vice Chancellor McVean said some students are in the degree applicable but not transferable level and others delay enrollment past their first year. He noted that these two options will essentially be eliminated with the implementation of AB 705 which mandates that colleges maximize the likelihood that students complete transfer level math and English in their first year.
- Cohort degree/certificate completers – cohorts are tracked for three years. The fall 2015 cohort ended with summer 2018 and updated data will show on-time completion for that group. Trustee Mohr asked if the definition of on-time completion is six semesters. Vice Chancellor McVean said 150% of normal time, or a three-year timetable, is a relatively standard definition of on-time completion. Trustee Mohr said the 2019-20 goal of 24% of students completing a degree within 150% of normal time seems very low given the amount of

money that is being spent on programs to improve this number. Trustee Mandelkern added that the stated goal does not match up mathematically with the goals listed by the Colleges. President Holober said these targets were set with the development of the Strategic Plan and were meant to be ambitious but not unattainable. He said the District's method of doing business has changed in the interim and he asked when it will be time to reexamine and adjust the targets. Vice Chancellor McVean said a comprehensive revision of the Strategic Plan is scheduled for next year. Trustee Mohr said he appreciates bold and audacious goals and would like to see them included in the revision.

- Non-cohort degree/certificate completers – data for 2017 is not yet available because the award of degrees and certificates is not typically finalized until mid-October. Vice Chancellor McVean said he will provide the data when it becomes available.
- CSU and UC transfers – the data will be available when these systems complete their January updates.
- San Mateo County high school take rate – 45% for the 2016-17 cohort. Efforts are underway to improve the high school alignment, such as an increase in dual enrollment.
Trustee Mandelkern asked if the take rate refers to the percentage of high school graduates who enroll in one of the Colleges and if it includes concurrent students. Vice Chancellor McVean said it is a rolling five-year average of the percentage of students who enroll in one of the Colleges and does not include concurrent enrollment.
- Course success rate differential in distance education – data is not showing a differential between distance education vs. face-to-face courses.

Skyline College

Dr. Luis Escobar, Dean of Counseling, said efforts at Skyline College, have centered on four main strategies:

1. Incentivizing full-time enrollment of students.
2. Creating intentional programming that encourages students to attend full-time and also makes it easier for them to attend full-time.
3. Emphasizing relationships with high school districts and individual feeder high schools.
4. Facilitating the transition to Skyline College through outreach and counseling at the high school campuses.

Dr. Escobar shared two of Skyline College's main efforts:

1. Expansion of the Promise Scholars Program. The program is based on City University of New York's (CUNY) Accelerated Study in Associate Programs (ASAP) model, which shows compelling data over a decade of being able to double and triple graduation rates and encouraging students to attend school full-time. The financial incentives have helped remove barriers that keep students from attending full-time, including waiver of fees, a monthly transportation incentive and the cost of textbooks. The completion rate is supported by dedicated counseling and career development collaboration. Recruitment efforts include messaging on the importance of attending full-time. The growth in the number of full-time students is in alignment with the scaling up of the program at the College.
2. Promise Summer Scholars Institute. The model for the Institute is based on acceleration, helping students start college at the transfer level. Ninety percent of students who have completed the Institute have placed in transfer level courses. Students who complete the Institute are guaranteed a spot in the Promise Scholars Program and almost all do participate in the program.

Lauren Ford, College Recruiter, said that through the High School Liaison Program and the Priority Enrollment Program (PEP), marketing efforts were designed to make sure high school students are able to matriculate successfully to Skyline College. In the 2016-17 school year, outreach staff worked with five of the ten feeder high schools and increased to seven high schools in the 2017-18 academic year. Intentional times were set aside throughout the academic year to complete all matriculation steps onsite at the high school campuses. The use of multiple measures also helped in completing the assessment piece and demystified the placement test. There was outreach to specialty programs such as Herman@s and Kapitiran to ensure these students received support. Consistent follow-up was conducted via emails, text messages and telephone calls to help students register for classes or help with any other barriers they were facing.

Ms. Ford said there has been increasing engagement with the community, with 258 events and activities throughout the fall 2016, spring 2017 and summer 2017 semesters.

Connor Fitzpatrick, Communications Manager, said the marketing campaign took a two-pronged approach. Traditional marketing included print and radio advertising, while the digital ad campaign served students via desktops, laptops and mobile devices. Digital ads were able to target specific locations, particular groups of people, such as individuals aged 18 to 24, and people with specific interests. For the summer/fall 2017 campaign, one digital campaign ran on Facebook and another ran through the media company Ad Taxi.

President Holober asked if staff is able to measure the reach of digital marketing. Mr. Fitzpatrick said the primary way to measure success is through click rates on the ads. He said the ads are targeted to specific populations, making it possible to determine who the users are.

Trustee Schwarz asked if staff is finding that family members and friends of individuals who have gone through the program are coming to the College. Dr. Escobar said there is anecdotal evidence of this, but there are no data at the present time.

Trustee Mandelkern asked how the average click-through rate on the Facebook platform compares with that on the Ad Taxi platform. Mr. Fitzpatrick said the Ad Taxi rates are around two percent, which is slightly higher than average for educational marketing. He said the Facebook click-through rates on Facebook were slightly lower, but were about average.

Trustee Mohr asked how many students from County high schools came to Skyline College this year and how many of them enrolled as full-time students. Dr. Escobar said approximately 1,250 new, first-time students came to Skyline College. Of these students, approximately 700 are full-time and of those 700, 507 are in the Promise Scholars Program. Trustee Mohr said this would be good benchmark data to be utilized over time.

Cañada College

Adam Windham, Interim Dean of Science and Technology, discussed data on the initial placement of first-time, full-time students in math. He said lower numbers of students are being placed in basic skills math and larger numbers are being placed into transfer level courses. He said this is due primarily to three factors:

1. Development of an accelerated pathway to transfer level for non-STEM majors. Math 190 serves students who would typically be placed into Elementary Algebra. Its function is to replace both Elementary and Intermediate Algebra by combining them into a one-semester, six unit course, offering a faster path to Statistics. Math 190 is not meant for students who will be Business majors at a UC or who will be STEM majors. Math 190 was first offered in fall 2013. Enrollment has grown as the course has become better known and placements have become more effective.
2. Adoption of multiple measures. Placement decisions are based on factors such as high school GPA and math courses completed in high school rather than solely on a placement test, resulting in students typically placing higher in the math sequence. Success rates for first-time students have remained approximately flat, indicating that students are not being left behind because of the use of multiple measures.
3. Proactive Registration. Collaborative efforts among Admissions and Records, Financial Aid, Counseling, Learning Center, STEM Center and faculty ensure that students are aware of the options available to them and are placed on the best pathway to meet their educational goals.

Vice President Goodman asked if Psychology 171 is an option for students who have completed Math 190 and if Math 190 could fulfill the prerequisite for Psychology 171 in place of Math 120. Mr. Windham said this has not been included in his discussions with math faculty and is not sure if it would be included as an alternative. He said that Math 190 includes the most relevant aspects of Math 120; therefore, it would be considered an equivalent and he would be surprised if it was not a possible prerequisite for Psychology 171. Vice President Goodman suggested that students be made aware of this alternative as part of the process. Mr. Fitzpatrick said this is an excellent suggestion and he will take it back to counseling and curriculum staff.

Trustee Mohr said Intermediate Algebra and Statistics are taught in the high schools. He suggested forming agreements with the high schools that would allow students to complete these courses through alignment with the Colleges or through dual enrollment. He said high schools typically offer Advanced Placement Statistics as well. He encouraged staff

to have discussions with the high schools on this issue. Mr. Fitzpatrick said multiple measures is part of that approach by not requiring students to repeat some courses that they took in high school.

Trustee Mandelkern said it is good to see data confirming the hypothesis that a single, high stakes placement test is not helpful to students in achieving their full potential. He asked if more accurate placements are impacting overall student success. Vice Chancellor McVean said data is not yet available but he expects to see increased success rates in the next couple of years due to more accurate placements, along with additional support in transfer level math and English. Trustee Mandelkern asked if the use of multiple measures puts the District at a competitive advantage in terms of attracting students. Vice Chancellor McVean said AB 705 will level the playing field, with the vast majority of districts expected to adopt the same placement guidelines. President Claire said high school superintendents have a greater level of confidence knowing that their graduates will be placed directly into transfer level courses, enabling them to move through the community college system. For this reason, he said he expects to see an increase in the take rates.

Anjélica Garcia, Vice President of Student Services at Skyline College, said that pedagogy also plays an important role. She said Cañada College math faculty recognized that instruction needed to be different and were ahead in this area. Tammy Robinson, Vice President of Instruction at Cañada College, said the math faculty recognized the need and did the hard work of examining and adapting the curriculum. She cited tutoring, counseling and institutional support as additional factors in the success at Cañada College.

College of San Mateo

Kristi Ridgway, Interim Dean of Language Arts, said College of San Mateo has continued to grant greater numbers of students access to transfer level English in the last few years. She said that about eighty percent of first-time, full-time students at College of San Mateo are placing into transfer level or higher English. Less than one percent are placing into basic skills English and the remainder are taking a degree applicable course. In 2016, the number of first-time, full-time students rose to 75 percent and increased in 2017 to 88 percent. Dean Ridgway said this correlated with (1) allowing use of the students' high school GPA or their grade in high school English to be used as part of the placement process and (2) elimination of one of the courses in the sequence for English.

Dean Ridgway said there is not a single factor for the maintenance of success rates. Along with the use of multiple measures, deliberate efforts include co-requisite support and streamlined course sequence. Since fall 2009, a five-unit transfer course with embedded reading support has been offered. Dean Ridgway said that during the past few years, there have been deliberate efforts by English faculty to be student-centered and to consider a comprehensive perspective that includes not only access to coursework, but also what the courses are and how they are taught. Instructors are taking additional time to make sure they know their students outside of the classroom as well as academically and are working to make sure students are well-connected to resources on campus. Dean Ridgway said the next step will be to address the kinds of support that might be needed by the small number of students who are in the one remaining basic skills section after that section is eliminated.

Krystal Duncan, Dean of Counseling, discussed the progression of the use of multiple measures as part of the placement process. In fall 2016, students with a 2.6 GPA were allowed to place into English 100. In fall 2017, high school transcripts were also allowed and this increased the number of students who placed into English 105. President Claire said with the future elimination of the basic skills English course, he is actively working with high school partners to discuss delivering that curriculum at the high school level so that students receive extra support at the appropriate time in their academic careers. Trustee Mandelkern said he would define the objective as making sure students are prepared when they come to the Colleges from the high schools.

Trustee Mandelkern noted the successful math placement program at Cañada College and the English placement at College of San Mateo. He asked what the plans are for the three Colleges to arrive at the same success rates. Vice Chancellor McVean said that while each College focused on a specific area for this presentation, they have all seen positive movement and have enjoyed increased collaboration with each other.

Trustee Mohr asked about the investment of resources that helped drive the process and what the need is for new or continued investments, particularly with regard to working with the high schools. President Claire said College of San Mateo has hired a full-time high school dual enrollment coordinator. Vice President Garcia said there have been increased dual enrollment efforts across the District. Kim Lopez, Vice President of Student Services at College of San Mateo, said the high schools are excited about the First Year Program and Promise Scholars Program, as well as AB 705. Vice President Lopez students need support services not just for their first year but for their second and even third years.

She said resources are needed to provide this support. Sandra Comerford, Vice President of Instruction at College of San Mateo, said professional development for faculty is another critical component for which support is needed.

Karrie Mitchell, District Vice President of Planning, Research and Institutional Effectiveness, demonstrated the Tableau Dashboard, showing how data can be disaggregated by college, part-time versus full-time status, gender, race ethnicity and international versus non-international students, along with a variety of other factors. She offered to meet with any Board member who is interested in doing so and invited Board members to send her questions.

Vice Chancellor McVean said he believes that the District's Strategic Plan and metrics, along with the focus on equity and success, are impressive. He recognized the intentional efforts of the Colleges. He said it will take sustained focus, innovation and resources to continue to support the work.

Trustee Mandelkern said he appreciates seeing meaningful data which provides quantitative measures of results. He said the Dashboard is a useful tool. He said the presentation was impressive and he thanked everyone for their hard work.

Trustee Mohr said the results shown during the presentation are professionally remarkable. He said this is what happens when there is a strategic plan and vision and resources are used in a focused way. He said the Colleges have become results oriented and this is making a difference in student performance.

President Holober said the presentation was excellent. He said a number of factors are involved in the success reported, including the development of the District Strategic Plan which includes measurable goals. He said the District is more purposeful in the way it is doing business, due both to innovative and creative work and to external requirements. President Holober said it adds up to the kind of change everyone is pleased to see.

President Holober said he understands that the high school take rate is to some extent a function of the economy. However, he said this is an area in which the District might be missing students who should be coming to the Colleges but are not doing so. He said he would like to address this in the future.

Trustee Mohr asked if staff is looking at data to see if the District is closing the gap with regard to social justice. Vice Chancellor McVean said this is a regular focus at each of the Colleges.

Trustee Mandelkern said that the development and implementation of strategic plans was a topic at a Community College League of California conference he attended two years ago. He said he would like to see the District be able to present at statewide conferences to share the knowledge it has gained.

Other Recommendations

PUBLIC HEARING OF THE 2018-19 FINAL BUDGET (18-9-100B)

It was moved by Trustee Mandelkern and seconded by Vice President Goodman to hold the public hearing. The motion carried, all members voting Aye. The public hearing was called to order at 8:06 p.m.

Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood and Chief Financial Officer Bernata Slater presented an overview of the budget, including information on the new state student-centered budget model; District budget guidelines; budget assumptions for the General Fund (Fund 1); Fund 1 revenues and expenses; three-year projections; community-supported status vs. state revenue limit; increased categorical funds; capital outlay; innovation funds; PERS and STRS increases; the Retirement Trust Fund; and other issues including accreditation, the District Strategic Plan, and longer term funding needs. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said there is \$97 million in the Futuris Other Post-Employment Benefits (OPEB) Trust. Combined with \$16 million in the Reserve Fund for Post-Retirement Benefits (Fund 8), the District has funded 97 percent of its \$117 million liability for post-retirement medical benefits. Later this year or in the next fiscal year, the District should be able to pay all of the premiums out of the trust.

Trustee Mandelkern said the Fund 1 information for 2018-19 shows a net change between the beginning fund balance and the ending fund balance of approximately -\$10.5 million. CFO Slater said the negative number is due to a carryover of approximately \$10 million from the prior year, which is budgeted as an expense. Chancellor Galatolo said this represents encumbrances in the prior year and will become realized expenses in the current year. Vice Chancellor Blackwood said this happens every year. She said that in this case, authorization was granted to spend the money in 2017-18 but some of the money is being carried over and is still authorized to be spent. She said that as the sites plan for

future multi-year projects, they will probably carry over some of the money to 2019-20. Trustee Mandelkern asked if there is a limit on the number of years encumbrances can run. Chancellor Galatolo said there is not a limit. President Holober said he recognizes that there are multi-year projects, but said the District has a good idea of what will be spent each year. He asked if the actual costs for the year are considered when building the budget. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said this depends largely on what the projects are and for how many years they will be funded.

Trustee Mandelkern asked if the County Assessor has provided guidance on how a potential recession would impact the District in terms of Assessed Valuation (AV). Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the Assessor does not provide guidance. Chancellor Galatolo discussed the historic changes in AV and said the trend for budget purposes would be a six percent growth over a ten year period. He said it is also important to try to build other revenue sources. Trustee Mandelkern said that because the District's budget has grown significantly, decreases in income would represent a smaller percentage of the total budget and would be easier to absorb.

President Holober asked what the source is for Innovation funds. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said that of the \$2 million in ongoing Innovation funds, \$1 million comes from the unrestricted general fund and \$1 million comes from the Housing fund, Auxiliary Services and the Foundation.

President Holober addressed the PERS and STRS increases (for PERS, from 11% in 2013-14 to 18% in 2018-19 and almost 24% in 2021-22; for STRS, from 8.25% in 2013-14 to 16% in 2018-19 and 19% in 2021-22). He asked if the future numbers are actual numbers or projections. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said they are projections; however, the STRS increases are in law and are unlikely to change. She said the PERS Board has the option to change every year. President Holober asked if PERS and STRS have gotten back to a solvency position because of the booming stock market of the past few years. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said PERS wants even more money now because: (1) they reduced their projection for ongoing earnings to reflect the fact that they did not make what they projected, and (2) they shortened the timeframe over which they are amortizing their liability. Trustee Mandelkern said that this year, for the first time in recent memory, PERS and STRS met or exceeded their target rate of return on investments. He said that when things were going well in 1997-99, they started cutting back on contribution percentages, which was a mistake. He said his sense is that they became aggressive in terms of increases in order to keep the system solvent. He said that if they started having at least average returns that approximated their goal, perhaps they could get more conservative on contribution percentages. Chancellor Galatolo said this is a nearly fully funded retirement system. He said it is irresponsible to fully fund the system and it is more responsible to fund a going concern at forty to sixty percent. He said going to a fifty percent level would free up \$200 billion to be used for education.

Trustee Mohr asked if staff has ever assessed the costs of accreditation. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said that for the last accreditation cycle, each college received an additional \$100,000 to hire a writer, but are now expected to pay from their own budgets. She added that the costs are significantly more than \$100,000.

Following the report, President Holober asked if there were any additional questions or comments from the public. Hearing none, he declared the public hearing closed at 8:58 p.m.

ADOPTION OF THE 2018-19 FINAL BUDGET (18-9-101B)

It was moved by Vice President Goodman and seconded by Trustee Mohr to approve the budget. Trustee Mandelkern asked if the budget can be used as a guide to determine the District's status in terms of the 50 Percent Law. Chancellor Galatolo said he does not know of a way to use budget numbers to predict the status because there are many factors that go into the calculation. He said he believes the number will likely be lower because the District continues to put money into wraparound services and release time for faculty in order to build programs. He said other community-supported districts are also not complying with the 50 Percent Law because they are investing in things that support the Promise Program.

Trustee Mandelkern said the Board previously discussed the 50 Percent Law and gave guidance to staff to initiate discussion with constituency groups to try to reach a mutually agreeable solution. Chancellor Galatolo said the District is ready to sunshine and he believes that is an appropriate forum for the conversation. Trustee Mohr said he believes it was the wish of the Board that the entities would come together to try to reach a mutual conclusion. Chancellor Galatolo said staff will reach out to the AFT executive leadership to pursue informal discussions.

President Holober said the budget report projects an ending reserve balance of approximately \$27 million. He asked if this amount is aside from the transfers out that are shown in the budget. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the

\$27 million is for unforeseen activities and cash flow and is not intended to be spent or moved. President Holoher asked if this is outside of the calculation of compliance with the 50 Percent Law; Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said it is. President Holoher asked if staff has looked at what is considered the current expense of education that could be reallocated out of the general fund. Chancellor Galatolo said money could be moved to categorical funds, but staff is trying to have the budget reflect a true spending document. President Holoher said that when the Board received the last audit report, it was noted that the District did not conform with the 50 Percent Law and the District received a letter from an attorney indicating at least a potential threat of litigation. He said he is trying to see if there are ways to close the gap without taking money away from programs that are succeeding and fulfilling the District's mission. He said one way might be to re-categorize funds. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said this is already being done; for example, the Colleges have been instructed to move all Promise expenses from the general fund to Fund 3.

Chancellor Galatolo noted that the 50 Percent Law calculation is based only on unrestricted general fund expenditures and income is not a factor. He said there are few options for conforming to the Law. He said teachers who are on release time and counselors could be shifted back into the classroom, but the load would be severely affected, with seven or eight students in some classes. He said the most viable option might be President Holoher's suggestion to move general fund money into categorical funds, such as the Foundation.

President Holoher said that converting some part-time faculty to full-time faculty would reduce the gap in compliance with the 50 Percent Law because full-time faculty earn more and receive benefits. He said he believes this also conforms with the goal of improving student achievement by providing a qualitative improvement in the student experience. He said he believes the District has the funding to do this at the present time. President Holoher said that during the discussion of the tentative budget, he indicated his hesitation about adopting the budget because of the nonconformance with the 50 Percent Law. He said his hesitation would be less if the District demonstrated good faith in moving toward the goal of closing the gap. To this end, he said he believes it would be prudent to put \$1 million of the \$27 million reserve into converting part-time faculty to full-time faculty. He said he would hope that the additional full-time faculty would come from the ranks of current part-time faculty. Trustee Mohr said he believes full-time faculty are a value-added proposition because of their strong connection with students and the learning outside of the classroom that occurs mostly with full-time faculty. He said the constituency groups should discuss this issue in good faith.

Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the \$27 million in the reserve is one-time money and is not for ongoing expenses. She said spending any of this money on salaries would continue to reduce the reserve every year. Trustee Mandelkern said he believes it would be possible to bring it back into balance with future changes in revenue and efficiencies in expenses. Executive Vice Chancellor said a discussion with faculty would be needed to see if they would be interested in this proposal because although it would reduce the gap by \$1 million, it would not bring the District into compliance with the 50 Percent Law.

Trustee Schwarz said she is not in favor of spending one-time money on salaries and believes it would set a bad precedent. She said she would need to see a proposal and have a conversation to see if faculty would even be interested because it does not bring the District into compliance.

Trustee Mohr said that when personnel reports are presented, the Board approves a number of ancillary faculty positions. He asked if these positions are rigorously examined to see how they are utilized in terms of efficiency and investment versus the criticality of their engagement around the Strategic Plan. He questioned whether some of the positions could be replaced with more classroom instructors. Trustee Mohr said he believes that an organization that has \$55 million more than a revenue limit district should be very rigorous in its thinking about how it uses affluence at that level and whether it is used as efficiently and productively as possible.

Trustee Schwarz said the Board previously had a discussion about how to use increased funding to help students. She said this resulted in a move toward the Promise Program, which required more classified staff than instructors. She said she supports the idea of moving part-time faculty to full-time positions, but does not support doing so to appease one group. She asked if the State requires a minimum amount of funds to be in a reserve and asked how the District's reserve amount compares with other community college districts. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the State does not have a required minimum for community colleges but recommends five percent. She said some community colleges have reserves as high as thirty percent. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said that some years ago, she brought a proposed policy on reserves to the Board, taken from the Government Finance Officers Association. She said that while the Board did not formally adopt a policy, it did agree on a goal of moving to a reserve of fifteen percent. Trustee Schwarz said that before making a decision on President Holoher's proposal, she believes more discussion is needed on

reducing the reserve, spending one-time money, how close the District is to conforming with the 50 Percent Law, and how full-time faculty placements would be determined.

Vice President Goodman said he commends the Board for having the conversation and for trying to creatively address the problem. He said the Board must ask if the solution being proposed is optimal and if data supports a need for more full-time faculty, knowing that classrooms are not full. He said the Board must also consider how the District would be affected if there is another economic downturn. Vice President Goodman said he does not believe a solution can be addressed at this meeting. He said it will not be known how close the District is to conforming with the 50 Percent Law until the end of the year. He said conversations with AFT should be initiated and the Board should continue discussions, making sure that every conversation is worthwhile.

Trustee Mandelkern said there seems to be agreement that having more full-time faculty is better and that converting some adjunct faculty to full-time is a good idea. He asked if the Board could begin to evaluate President Holober's proposal to shift \$1 million to convert part-time faculty to full-time in the context of the budget. He said there is \$200 million in the general fund and this proposal would use only one-half of one percent of that amount and could be made to work within the budget.

Chancellor Galatolo said he supports the idea of converting part-time faculty to full-time status; however, he said it troubles him if this is used as a mechanism to solve the issue with the 50 Percent Law.

President Holober said the current ratio of full-time to part-time faculty is two to one. He said the Board has the opportunity to increase this ratio without noticeable impact on the budget. He said he believes this would make a difference in the quality of instruction and he does not believe it would be appealing anyone. President Holober said he believes this would be the right statement of leadership for the Board to make.

Trustee Mandelkern suggested an amendment to the motion to adopt the budget, specifying that the Board examine the possibility of converting some part-time faculty to full-time status. Trustee Schwarz questioned why this would be added as an amendment since the Board can have discussions at any time. President Holober agreed that an amendment would be needed only if it was for approval to move \$1 million out of the reserve.

Trustee Mohr said the Board previously asked that the two parties begin discussions to address the issue of the 50 Percent Law. He said this must be done in good faith, which requires considering how it fits into the big picture and examining every alternative.

After this discussion, the motion to approve the 2018-19 final budget carried, with President Holober abstaining and all other members voting Aye.

STATEMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS

Trustee Mohr said Professor Kate Browne provided an invitation to a fundraiser for the Institute for Human and Social Development (IHSD) to be held on October 21. He asked that staff forward the invitation to the Board.

Trustee Mandelkern congratulated President Claire and College of San Mateo on the football team, which has enjoyed a good start to the season. Trustee Mandelkern said he met with Tom Nuris, who is running unopposed for a seat on the Board, representing Trustee Area 2. Trustee Mandelkern said he looks forward to working with Mr. Nuris.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned by consensus at 9:48 p.m.

Submitted by

Ron Galatolo, Secretary

Approved and entered into the proceedings of the October 10, 2018 meeting.

Maurice Goodman, Vice President-Clerk

**Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Board of Trustees
San Mateo County Community College District
September 30, 2015, San Mateo, CA**

The meeting was called to order at 6:10 p.m.

Board Members Present: President Patricia Miljanich, Vice President Dave Mandelkern, Trustees Richard Hober, Thomas Mohr and Karen Schwarz, Student Trustee Rupinder Bajwa

Others Present: Chancellor Ron Galatolo, Executive Vice Chancellor Kathy Blackwood, Skyline College President Regina Stanback Stroud, College of San Mateo President Michael Claire, District Academic Senate President Diana Bennett

Pledge of Allegiance

DISCUSSION OF THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA

Vice President Mandelkern noted that the agenda for both open and closed sessions is quite full. He suggested that the Board consider ending the open session portion of the meeting at approximately 8:30 p.m. and tabling items not addressed by that time until a future meeting. The Board agreed to monitor progress of agenda items and make a decision on tabling items as the meeting progresses.

MINUTES

It was moved by Trustee Hober and seconded by Trustee Mohr to approve the minutes of the study session of September 9, 2015. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

STATEMENTS FROM EXECUTIVES

Chancellor Galatolo said he received brochures from Chief Elections Officer Mark Church listing polling places for the November 3, 2015 election. As requested by the Board, all of the District Colleges are listed as polling places.

Skyline College President Stanback Stroud asked everyone to join her in sending condolences to Connie Beringer, former Dean of Language Arts at Skyline College on the loss of her husband, Dr. Jack Fiedler, who passed away recently. Dr. Fiedler was a former administrator, counselor and faculty member in the District.

College of San Mateo President Claire said Dr. Fiedler was a faculty member at College of San Mateo. He asked that the Board adjourn this meeting in his memory. President Claire said the Child Development Center received a one-time gift of close to \$592,000 from the Lazarus Foundation Trust. President Claire said the Food Pantry, which is a partnership with the Second Harvest Food Bank, had a successful opening.

Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the District submitted an application for the Silicon Valley Leadership Group's "Red Tape to Red Carpet" award. Congresswoman Jackie Speier, State Senator Jerry Hill and State Assemblymember Kevin Mullin provided letters of support. Chancellor Galatolo said two Board members recommended that the District apply for the award.

District Academic Senate President Bennett said she is participating in the Institutional Effectiveness Partnership Initiative's Partnership Resource Team as a faculty member. President Bennett said the Academic Senate will hold a Districtwide open forum for faculty and others for the Online Education Initiative and Canvas.

BOARD SERIES PRESENTATION – INNOVATIONS IN TEACHING, LEARNING AND SUPPORT SERVICES: SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT CENTER AT COLLEGE OF SAN MATEO (15-9-3C)

Kathy Ross, Dean of Business/Technology at College of San Mateo, said the College was awarded a grant to run a Small Business Development Center (SBDC) on campus and the SBDC opened its doors in 2013. She said SBDCs are an extension of the Small Business Administration under the Department of Commerce. Dean Ross introduced Robert Shoffner, the faculty member who leads the program.

Mr. Shoffner said there are 1,100 SBDCs nationwide and 35 in California. He said SBDCs are an integral component of the Small Business Administration's network of training and counseling services. The SBDC at College of San Mateo

receives funding from the federal, state and local governments, as well as from the District and private companies. There is no fee charged to the businesses who use the services provided by the SBDC.

Mr. Shoffner said small businesses are the engine of job growth in the United States. He said the SBDC helps businesses achieve their entrepreneurial dreams and helps make the economy of San Mateo County stronger. The advisory staff includes people with considerable industry and functional expertise.

Mr. Shoffner said the SBDC has clients in just about every city in San Mateo County; fifty percent of the clients are located in San Mateo, Daly City and Redwood City. A large number of business sectors are served, with the service establishment sector comprising 42%. In 2014, the approximate ownership of businesses by group was: women-30%; African American-1%; Asian-19%; and Hispanic-12%. The SBDC is focused on how to help minority businesses in the County.

Mr. Shoffner said the SBDC offers counseling, along with workshops and training events. He discussed a variety of events including Getting to Wow with Bill Reichert and The Angels Forum with Carol Sands. The SBDC is also partnering with the District's Community, Continuing and Corporate Education for a five seminar series.

Mr. Shoffner said the SBDC has a strong focus on student engagement. He served as consultant to the College of San Mateo Business Club for the Innovator Forum event in spring 2015. The Center is using student interns to assist with social media strategy and will be utilizing a team of students to assist with counseling one or more business clients under the direction of the Center Director and business advisors. The Center is working with the College of San Mateo Cosmetology Department to develop a series of workshops to prepare students for entrepreneurship and self-employment. Mr. Shoffner said the Center is also reaching out to students at Cañada College and Skyline College.

Mr. Shoffner said the SBDC has had 130 new business clients since its opening in 2013. The total client base is 3,000. There were 980 total client hours; 114 total clients counseled; 8 new businesses created; and 50 jobs created. Success stories include Amour, Seedles, Grace Yoga, and San Francisco Wine School.

Mr. Shoffner said plans for 2015-16 include assisting the Bay Area Entrepreneur Center of Skyline College with a major rebranding effort; expanding student engagement efforts at all three campuses; expanding outreach efforts to ethnic/minority communities; and holding the San Mateo County Economic Summit.

Trustee Mohr asked how the SBDC is promoted to the business community. Mr. Shoffner said social media is utilized and he also conducts outreach by attending several events each week, such as meetings of Chambers of Commerce and business organizations.

Vice President Mandelkern asked Mr. Shoffner to compare and contrast the activities of the SBDC and the Bay Area Entrepreneur Center (BAEC) and asked if there is an opportunity for cooperation between the two. Mr. Shoffner said there are opportunities for collaboration. He said the businesses that typically come to the BAEC are early stage businesses which can be referred to the SBDC for additional assistance. He said the SBDC has some counselors at the BAEC. The BAEC will also be used as the Northern California site for the SBDC and some events will be held there. President Stanback Stroud said the BAEC is an incubator center; there are seven tenants who pay a small amount of rent to have their businesses housed there.

Vice President Mandelkern said the Board previously was presented with information on the EDGE, an initiative of the San Mateo Chamber of Commerce. He asked how this initiative compares and contrasts with the SBDC. Mr. Shoffner said he sees the SBDC and the EDGE as complementary. He said the EDGE is set up to help technology-oriented businesses interface with the City and get established in downtown San Mateo. He said the SBDC can help the businesses in other areas, such as counseling and securing of capital.

Trustee Holober asked if the SBDC is available to non-profit organizations. Mr. Shoffner said it serves for-profit businesses primarily, but will work with non-profit organizations on a selective basis.

Student Trustee Bajwa asked how students may take advantage of the SBDC's resources and workshops. Mr. Shoffner said events are posted on the District website and he also reaches out to the business clubs on the campuses. He added

that all events are free of charge to students. President Claire said business faculty at College of San Mateo encourage students to attend SBDC events.

STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

Tom Bauer, Vice Chancellor of Auxiliary Services and Enterprise Operations, said the Auxiliary Services Department's annual report is finished and copies are placed at each Board member's place on the dais. He acknowledged the outstanding work of Kevin Chak, Manager of the Skyline College Bookstore, and Amanda Bortolo, who works in the Skyline College Copy Center, who put the report together. He said the pictures in the report show that (1) the community members pictured are intertwined and integrated with the services, and (2) the employees pictured – whether they work in the Bookstores, Food Service, the San Mateo Athletic Club or Community Education – are committed to the success of Auxiliary Services.

Maxine Turner, a member of the public, asked how and why a new, large demolition and new construction project (Building 19) was added to the capital projects between the time that the EIR Notice of Preparation went out in May and the time that the EIR came out for review. President Miljanich explained that this portion of the Board meeting is set aside to hear statements from members of the public but the Board is not allowed to engage in dialogue about an item that is not on the agenda. She said José Nuñez, Vice Chancellor of Facilities Planning, Maintenance and Operations, will follow up with an email response to Ms. Turner.

Donna Bischoff, a member of the public, said she has complained to the District about watering on the College of San Mateo campus in the middle of the day and watering in general. She said she was provided information on the District's water conservation efforts. She said she was horrified to see that in July and August, new sod was being put in for the North Gateway project. She said she does not believe there is a correlation between positive student outcomes and the amount of sod on a campus. She said sod uses water and manpower and produces pollution and runoff. She said the District's efforts to conserve water are positive, but she asked that the District reconsider putting in sod on the campuses.

NEW BUSINESS

APPROVAL OF PERSONNEL ITEMS: CHANGES IN ASSIGNMENT, COMPENSATION, PLACEMENT, LEAVES, STAFF ALLOCATIONS AND CLASSIFICATION OF ACADEMIC AND CLASSIFIED PERSONNEL (15-9-3A)

It was moved by Trustee Holober and seconded by Trustee Mohr to approve the items in the report. Vice President Mandelkern asked for confirmation that the normal hiring process was followed for all appointments listed on the report. Vice Chancellor Eugene Whitlock said the hiring process was followed for all positions except reclassifications, which are not subject to the hiring process. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA

President Miljanich said the consent agenda consists of board reports 15-9-1CA through 15-9-9CA as listed on the printed agenda. Trustee Schwarz requested that items 15-9-6CA and 15-9-7CA be removed from the consent agenda for further discussion. It was moved by Trustee Mohr and seconded by Trustee Holober to approve the remaining items on the consent agenda. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

ACCEPTANCE OF PROGRAM SELF-EVALUATION FOR THE COLLEGE OF SAN MATEO CHILD DEVELOPMENT CENTER AND SKYLINE COLLEGE EARLY LEARNING & CHILD DEVELOPMENT CENTER (15-9-6CA)

It was moved by Trustee Schwarz and seconded by Vice President Mandelkern to accept the self-evaluation. Trustee Schwarz said the board report indicates that the self-evaluation will be presented to parents of children enrolled in the Centers. She asked if they will receive copies of this written report or if it will be a verbal report. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said she believes the parents will receive a verbal report and that the written report will be posted on the website. Trustee Schwarz said she would like the Board to have an opportunity to attend a session at which a verbal report is presented and asked that the Board be notified about the scheduling of the sessions. Trustee Mohr said it would be helpful for the Board to have a summary of findings rather than the lengthy report. Chancellor Galatolo suggested that the District seek Board approval tonight and follow up with a summary of findings and a timeline for the verbal reports to parents. After this discussion, the motion to accept the self-evaluation carried, all members voting Aye.

APPROVAL OF APPOINTMENT OF OFFICIAL REPRESENTATIVES TO THE ADULT-EDUCATION COLLEGE AND CAREER EDUCATIONAL LEADERSHIP (ACCEL); AGREEMENT TO REPORT ON FUND USE AND OUTCOMES; AND AGREEMENT TO RULES AND PROCEDURES (15-9-7CA)

It was moved by Trustee Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Holober to approve the governance structure as detailed in the report. Trustee Schwarz said the report is lengthy and it might be helpful for the Board to receive a brief presentation on ACCEL. Gregory Anderson, Vice President of Instruction at Cañada College, said this report is simply a request for the Board to accept the governance and funding structure of ACCEL as required by the State. Chancellor Galatolo said ACCEL is an ongoing program and reports will continue to be provided periodically. After this discussion, the motion carried, all members voting Aye.

Other Recommendations

APPROVAL OF DISTANCE EDUCATION SUBSTANTIVE CHANGE PROPOSAL FOR SKYLINE COLLEGE TO BE SUBMITTED TO THE ACCREDITING COMMISSION FOR COMMUNITY AND JUNIOR COLLEGES (ACCJC) (15-9-1B)

It was moved by Trustee Mohr and seconded by Trustee Holober to approve the proposal as detailed in the report. The motion carried, all members voting Aye. Trustee Mohr said he appreciates the inclusion of a process for students to evaluate whether they are ready for online learning and the availability of advising and counseling.

ADOPTION OF DISTRICT STRATEGIC PLAN (15-9-2B)

It was moved by Trustee Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Mohr to adopt the Strategic Plan as presented. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said development of the Strategic Plan began in September 2014 and was spearheaded by two committees. The Strategic Plan Steering Committee was composed of two Board members, Chancellor, College Presidents, President of the District Academic Senate, Deputy and Executive Vice Chancellors, Vice Chancellor(s) of Educational Services and Planning, and Director of Community and Government Relations. The District Strategic Planning Task Force was composed of the same group, minus the two Board members and adding the College Researchers and College Academic Senate Presidents. In addition, Rick Voorhees and Tom Gonzales of the Voorhees Group provided assistance.

Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said multiple forums were held to discuss: (1) the planning process, including the environmental scan and planning assumptions; (2) Districtwide data including trends for demographic shifts, instructional program trends, degrees and certificates awarded, and student success; and (3) draft goals and strategies. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said she received many subsequent emails and telephone calls which provided extensive additional information and revisions to the goals and strategies. Presentations were made to District and College participatory governance groups and to the Board. District Academic Senate President Bennett said the Strategic Plan was discussed and reviewed at the District Academic Senate and local Senate levels and faculty provided significant input. She said she is confident that faculty had adequate opportunity to engage in the process.

Jamillah Moore, Vice Chancellor of Educational Services and Planning, noted that the Board has had an excellent vision regarding student access and success and said the Strategic Plan goals are aligned with the Boards goals. She outlined each of the four strategic goals and discussed how they are aligned with Board goals.

Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the Strategic Plan is also tied to resource allocation. She said the new resource allocation model includes annual funding for an Innovation Fund to support program development. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said that when she builds the budget each year, she also includes budgeting for two years out. She said that for this budget cycle, she included ongoing money in each year to continue to expand and achieve the goals of the Strategic Plan. She said staff will brief the Board at the annual retreat and again at the end of the year on how the money was spent and what was achieved.

Vice Chancellor Moore said the Strategic Plan is accompanied by a set of metrics and planning assumptions. She said the metrics are a summary of data-driven trends and their implications and are a work in progress. The planning assumptions are statements that shape the planning process and create a shared future vision. Vice Chancellor Moore said the Strategic Plan is grounded in its foundation in the Colleges' Educational Master Plans. She said the programs included in the Strategic Plan are the Middle Colleges at Cañada College and Skyline College; Project Change at College of San Mateo; and the SparkPoint Centers at Cañada College and Skyline College. Vice Chancellor Moore said there is work to be done, but those involved in the planning process believe the Strategic Plan is a working document that addresses the

importance of access, equity and completion. She said the Board will receive ongoing updates and will engage in dialogue regarding progress and what adjustments might need to be made.

Vice Chancellor Moore said three students will describe their experiences in existing programs.

Nick is a student who participated in Project Change, which serves youth who have been through the juvenile justice system. He said the program provides support that is out of the ordinary. He said he is the first in his family to attend college and he did not understand the process. He said Project Change guided him through it and also provided financial help for textbooks. He said he realized he could either continue on the path he was on or become whatever he wanted to be. Nick said he is leaving tomorrow to join AmeriCorps. He said he would not have been able to accomplish what he has without the help of Project Change. Vice President Mandelkern asked Nick about his educational goals. Nick said his long-term goal is to become a firefighter and eventually a chief. He said he wants to get a dual major in Fire Science and Sociology and transfer to a four-year institution to earn a degree.

Alexandra Wildman, a student at the Middle College at Cañada College, said attending Middle College was the best decision she has ever made. She said students experience “culture shock” when they first arrive at the Middle College; however, the weeklong orientation provides the opportunity to explore the campus and be introduced to resources and services that are not available at the high schools. She said that the Middle College teachers are also the students’ counselors and they help students every step of the way. Ms. Wildman said Middle College students are fully integrated into the campus. She currently serves as Vice President of the Associated Students of Cañada College (ASCC) and other Middle College students serve on the ASCC Board with her. Vice President Mandelkern asked Ms. Wildman about her educational goals. Ms. Wildman said she is interested in Public Health. She hopes to eventually earn a Ph.D. and work for the National Institutes of Health.

Monique Hernandez said she is a single mother who returned to school at Skyline College after taking ten years off. She said her EOPS Counselor advised her of the resources and services available on campus and connected her with the SparkPoint Center and with a job opportunity. She said SparkPoint has had a tremendous impact on her life. She was able to gain access to services for which she was eligible, receive credit counseling and improve her credit score, and meet with a financial coach to learn how to budget and build plans for the future. She said she not only gained advocates, but learned how to become an advocate for herself. She said she was able to help other students through her job at SparkPoint and witnessed the impact of the Food Pantry and Grove Scholarships for students in need. Ms. Hernandez said she transferred from Skyline College and is now in her second year at San Francisco State University. Her goal is to earn a doctorate in marriage and family therapy.

Trustee Schwarz thanked the students for their comments. She said it is gratifying to hear of their success and said she is happy that the District offers such opportunities for students. She said she is pleased that Middle College students have become more and more involved in campus life.

Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood thanked the students for sharing their stories. She also thanked the College Researchers who provided a multitude of data to the Voorhees Group; Sue Harrison, Roxanne Brewer and Ginny Brooks for editing assistance; everyone who came to forums and meetings to participate in the process; and the Board for encouraging and directing the development of the Strategic Plan. She expressed special thanks to Trustees Holober and Mohr who served on the Steering Committee.

Trustee Schwarz thanked Trustees Holober and Mohr for giving their time and providing information to the entire Board. She said she agrees that having a working document that can be tweaked as needed is the appropriate road to take.

Trustee Mohr said the Strategic Plan is the means by which the Board gives direction to the District. He said it is also the platform by which partnerships are formed throughout the District and how discourse is conducted around the well-being of students. He said it provides the opportunity to understand the kinds of investments the District is making in students. Trustee Mohr said he appreciates the tremendous effort that has gone into the development of the Strategic Plan. He said it is very explicit and goes to the heart of the matter.

Vice President Mandelkern thanked everyone at the District and Colleges who participated in the strategic planning process, along with Trustees Holober and Mohr. Vice President Mandelkern said he appreciates the inclusion of the SWOT (strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats) Analysis. He suggested that the Strategic Plan also address:

1. remediation of the anticipated retirement of a number of key employees
2. the competitive dynamic with for-profit colleges

Vice President Mandelkern said his suggestions are the opinion of only one Board member and are meant to be constructive.

Trustee Holober acknowledged Trustee Mohr's important role in how the Strategic Plan evolved. He said Trustee Mohr repeatedly stressed the Board's role in establishing and measuring goals and having accountability around academic performance, etc. He said this is a crucial element of the Strategic Plan. Trustee Holober said another important concept in the document is timing; the District is experiencing relatively good times economically, allowing it to enhance academic offerings. He said the focus on equity and justice, bringing added resources to bear on targeted populations who could benefit from having access and the ability to succeed, is a key message.

Trustee Holober said it is very important to acknowledge and understand that the Strategic Plan is a working document and that the metrics are placeholder numbers rather than directives. Vice President Mandelkern agreed and said he hopes the metrics will be revisited and honed quite frequently.

Trustee Holober said Strategic Goal #4 evolved over the course of the writing of the Plan. He said it originally spoke only to entrepreneurial activities but now addresses three areas which he said he believes should be ranked in importance as follows:

1. Preserve the District's community-supported status
2. Be prudent in how money is spent, i.e. utilize program review
3. Entrepreneurial activities

Trustee Holober said the Board has had debate on some entrepreneurial activities, reflecting differing philosophies on what kinds of activities are appropriate. He said he believes there should be full-fledged Board discussions when embarking on entrepreneurial activities.

Student Trustee Bajwa said the District Student Council discussed the Strategic Plan and supports it enthusiastically. He said he is pleased that it is a living document and that its title includes "Students First."

Vice President Mandelkern said he believes the issue of job placement as a goal could be expanded upon and improved in Goal #2. He said he also would like to see metrics around this issue.

With regard to the issue of student success in Goal #2, Vice President Mandelkern said the State-mandated metrics are still being used and he would like to see a more individualized look at the District's students' goals. He said he believes that students who accomplish what they came to the Colleges to do should be recorded as successes. Trustee Mohr said this issue was discussed extensively. He said it is assumed that data will be brought back over a period of time by the College researchers and definitions need to be brought together soon. Trustee Mohr added that he believes there is a strong need for a researcher at the District Office. Trustee Holober said Goal #1 includes the State-mandated metrics on transfer and degree/certificate completion. He said an additional metric could speak to students who complete an educational plan indicating that their goal is to brush up on skills and then achieve that goal. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said most students who take only one or two courses do not complete an educational plan, making it difficult to obtain data. She said 65% to 70% of District students complete educational plans. Vice President Mandelkern said metrics are critical and he would like to see 100% of students complete educational plans. Chancellor Galatolo said he believes the focus for developing metrics should first be on current initiatives, e.g. Middle College, First Year Experience and Project Change.

Vice President Mandelkern said he believes that protecting the District's community-supported status is the most significant factor in Goal #4. He asked about the metric regarding building coalitions among other community-supported districts. Chancellor Galatolo said protecting the District's status is a primary focus. He said the District has attempted to form coalitions; however, this has proven difficult because of the small number of community-supported districts and the frequent leadership changes within those districts. Vice President Mandelkern said this is one of the most significant issues for the District and he would be open to suggestions on developing metrics. President Miljanich said it would be difficult to develop meaningful metrics for this issue. She noted that Chancellor Galatolo has shown great leadership in this area.

Vice President Mandelkern said the Strategic Plan does not address how to replicate successful programs, such as MathJam and Writing in the End Zone, across the campuses. He said he hopes this will be addressed moving forward. Trustee Schwarz said this has been discussed when presentations are made to the Board. She said she believes each College should decide if a program would work on its campus. She said she appreciates the diversity of what occurs at each College. President Claire said each campus has its own personality, but this does not prevent them from considering ideas from the other Colleges. Trustee Mohr said the Strategic Plan brings the Colleges closer together than they were before. Vice President Mandelkern said he believes it is important to examine best practices and he hopes successful programs will be applied across the District when it makes sense. President Stanback Stroud said there is a culture of collaboration in the District and the Colleges are willing to learn from each other.

President Miljanich said she appreciates the focus on connecting Board goals with the goals in the Strategic Plan. She said she understands that the Strategic Plan is a work in progress and she appreciates everything that has been done to this point.

After this discussion, the motion to adopt the Strategic Plan carried, all members voting Aye.

ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION NO. 15-27 CALLING ON THE ACCREDITING COMMISSION FOR COMMUNITY AND JUNIOR COLLEGES TO GRANT CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO FULL ACCREDITATION (15-9-3B)

It was moved by Trustee Mohr and seconded by Trustee Schwarz to adopt Resolution No. 15-27. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

APPROVAL OF SOLE SOURCE PURCHASE OF PRECOR FITNESS EQUIPMENT (15-9-100B)

It was moved by Trustee Mohr and seconded by Trustee Schwarz to approve the sole source purchase as detailed in the report. The motion carried, with Trustees Holober, Miljanich, Mohr and Schwarz voting Aye. Vice President Mandelkern had stepped away from the meeting during consideration of this item and did not cast a vote.

APPROVAL OF CONTRACT AWARD FOR CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM PHASE 3 (CIP3) CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT SERVICES (15-9-101B)

It was moved by Trustee Mohr and seconded by Trustee Schwarz to approve the contract as detailed in the report. Ms. Turner asked how the Board can vote to authorize projects before the ERI is certified. Karen Powell, Executive Director of Facilities Planning and Operations, said the District is precluded from moving forward with construction until the EIR is certified; however, the District's counsel and environmental consulting firm have both confirmed that it is appropriate and usual to engage in planning efforts. Ms. Turner said that if a project does not make it through the CEQA process, the District will have wasted money on a project that cannot be built. President Miljanich said the District will be prepared and ready to begin when a project does make it through the process. Ms. Powell said the schedule to complete the EIR comment period and adopt the plan dovetails well with the timing to initiate the detail design for the projects. She said it is unlikely that the detail design will get underway or incur significant costs before the EIR is certified.

Trustee Holober asked about the timeframe for the CEQA process. Ms. Powell said staff hopes to be able to ask the Board to certify the plan at its December meeting, after the close of the comment period. Trustee Holober asked about the timeframe during which the money for the proposed Swinerton contract would be expended. Vice Chancellor Nuñez said the proposed contract period is seven years. Chancellor Galatolo said expenses would be incurred largely subsequent to the CEQA review and when construction begins. Vice President Mandelkern noted that the proposed construction management contract includes all projects in CIP3; therefore, if a project is challenged, many other projects could still move forward. He said it is important to keep spending in line with projects that have been authorized by the Board.

After this discussion, the motion to approve the contract award carried, all members voting Aye.

AUTHORIZATION FOR CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM PHASE 3 (CIP3) PROJECT DELIVERY METHODS, PHASE ONE PROJECTS (15-9-102B)

It was moved by Trustee Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Mohr to authorize the delivery methods as detailed in the report. Ms. Bischoff said the report includes the planned demolition of Buildings 20 and 20A at College of San Mateo. Chancellor Galatolo said this is planned pending the outcome of the State Supreme Court decision.

Trustee Holober asked what the projected cost of the first-wave projects is. Vice Chancellor Nuñez said the cost for the first seven projects is \$362 million. The total cost for all projects is \$481 to \$530 million. Trustee Holober said he has raised reservations regarding priorities, particularly with regard to Cañada College Building 1. He said this project has more than doubled in size since the time the District was estimating projects for the general obligation bond ballot measure. He said he would prefer to remove this project from the list pending the outcome of a potential Statewide facilities bond which will be on the ballot in 2016 and would allot the District approximately \$29 million. Vice Chancellor Nuñez said the Statewide bond is not applicable to the Cañada College Building 1 project. President Miljanich said she is not in favor of removing this project. She said she does not feel qualified to override the Colleges' determination of the needs for their campuses. Trustee Mohr said he is very comfortable with moving forward with the project. He said College faculty and staff are very much in touch with the needs of the community and students they serve. He said there is a lack of equity when comparing the current facility with the facilities on the other campuses. Trustee Mohr said students deserve something better for their entire well-being and he believes this is why faculty and staff brought the project forward as a top priority.

Trustee Holober said he does not question the need for a new state-of-the-art facility at Cañada College to serve the needs of students and the community. He said he is concerned with the expansion of the project, largely to accommodate an athletic club for the surrounding community. He said he has concerns about the way the current athletic club at College of San Mateo is operated, including employment issues.

Vice President Mandelkern asked if there is prioritization among the seven first-wave projects. Vice Chancellor Nuñez said there is a sequence of projects, with the Cañada College Kinesiology and Skyline College Environmental buildings coming first, followed by the Math/Science building at Cañada College. He said there is only a one month gap between projects. Vice President Mandelkern said he would prioritize the Math/Science building first because of the critical demand for educational facilities. Chancellor Galatolo said that, while the new Math/Science building will improve the labs that are currently available in Buildings 16/18, classes and labs can still be held in the current building. He said Building 1 is critical because the facility has become a drain on the institution in terms of the effectiveness of classes conducted in the building. Chancellor Galatolo said the plan to expand Building 1 to include a fitness facility will largely underwrite the cost of replacing the current facility.

Trustee Schwarz said she appreciates that the report reflects what the Board requested, which was for the faculty and staff at the Colleges to prioritize projects and identify appropriate delivery methods. She said she supports the request for authorization as it is.

Ms. Turner said that when the Measure C bond measure passed, Chancellor Galatolo said the District would be able to complete all of the improvements in the Facilities Master Plan that was in place at the time. She said that after the District hired Steinberg Architects, it did an inadequate CEQA review process and destroyed the historic campus at College of San Mateo by tearing down buildings and replacing them with large, extravagant buildings. Ms. Turner said she believes the Board has been given bad advice by Chancellor Galatolo and some of the architects and planners hired by the District. She said the educational programs at the Colleges seem wonderful but she believes the District has been wasteful on construction projects.

Vice President Mandelkern said the recommended delivery method for four of the first-wave projects is Construction Management at Risk (CMAR). He said the District does not have experience with this method but has had previous success with the Design-Build method. He suggested that the CMAR method might be used on one project first to see how it works. Ms. Powell said many of the most reputable and experienced contractors in the District's market are pursuing work only under CMAR and have said they will not pursue hard bid contracts. She also said staff has worked to select the method that best mitigates risks associated with particular projects. She said staff believes the District will get the best value by using CMAR for the four projects, without taking on undue liability for errors and omissions in the design documents. Trustee Mohr said he did considerable reading on the CMAR method. He said it has significant advantages, including pre-construction services; constructability expertise throughout the project; cost estimating done upfront; budgeting schedule more carefully laid out; and guaranteed cost of the work.

After this discussion, the motion to authorize the CIP3 project delivery methods for the phase one projects carried, with Trustees Mandelkern, Miljanich, Mohr and Schwarz voting Aye and Trustee Holober voting No.

ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION NO. 15-28 REGARDING BOARD ABSENCE (15-9-103B)

It was moved by Trustee Holober and seconded by Trustee Schwarz to adopt the resolution as detailed in the report. The motion carried, with Trustees Holober, Mandelkern, Mohr and Schwarz voting Aye and President Miljanich abstaining.

At this time, the Board agreed to table Information Reports 15-9-4C, A Discussion of Liabilities, and 15-9-5C, Discussion of Board of Trustees Self-Evaluation. These items will be presented at a future meeting.

COMMUNICATIONS

President Miljanich said the Board received an invitation to participate in the Policy Advisory Committee for the San Mateo County sea level rise vulnerability assessment. The first meeting will take place on the morning of October 7. Trustee Mohr has volunteered to attend the meeting and report back to the Board. President Miljanich said the Board also received an email from a candidate for the ACCT Diversity Committee asking for Board members' support.

STATEMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS

Trustee Schwarz said she attended the Skyline College Success Summit which was very well done. She said housing and transportation continue to be the two most significant issues facing the County. She said she was particularly interested in two ideas that were discussed: (1) the possibility of partnering with city shuttles, and (2) using pipe bursting to repair pipes. Vice Chancellor Nuñez said pipe bursting has been used on all three campuses.

Vice President Mandelkern said he visited the Bay Area Entrepreneur Center of Skyline College. He said it is an impressive facility located in the heart of the San Bruno community. He said the BAEC and the Small Business Development Center both provide opportunities to fulfill the mission of reaching out to the community to provide resources. Vice President Mandelkern said he attended the Skyline College Success Summit. He said the content and speakers, including Chancellor Galatolo, were first rate and he hopes this event will continue to grow.

Trustee Holober said he submitted a third party comment to the Department of Education on its review of the ACCJC. He said he addressed the finding that the ACCJC does not have acceptance by the educational community and said he agreed with this finding. He said he will forward his comments to the rest of the Board.

Trustee Mohr said he attended a meeting of an advisory committee composed of SMCCCD members and Sequoia Union High School District members to consider cooperating in the development of a new school. He quoted from a statement of the Sequoia Union High School governing board which indicates that they are interested in a Small School with content-specific courses that would provide students with practical and theoretical knowledge to apply in work-based learning environments, i.e. linked learning. Trustee Mohr said he believed it was the intention of the SMCCCD Board to join with the Sequoia District in the formation of an Early College High School which is a different concept than linked learning. He said he and Vice President Anderson will be attending another committee meeting and he will report back to the Board. Trustee Schwarz and Vice President Mandelkern said they agree that the Board should hold further discussions on this issue.

Trustee Mohr said the executive reports submitted to the Board as part of the board packets are superlative. He said activities offered to students outside of the classroom are superior to many universities and take the educational process to a very high level.

Student Trustee Bajwa said student leaders at the Colleges have identified issues and concerns that affect students and have brought them to the District Student Council. He said the Council is looking at ways to address the issues. He said student body fees have not changed since 2001 and a recommendation to increase the fees may come to the Board for consideration. Student Trustee Bajwa said the Board will be invited to attend District Student Council meetings at which certain issues are addressed.

RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION

President Miljanich said that during Closed Session, the Board will (1) consider the personnel items listed as 1A and 1B on the printed agenda, (2) hold a conference with legal counsel regarding three cases of potential litigation as listed on the printed agenda, and (3) hold a conference with agency labor negotiator Eugene Whitlock; the employee organizations are AFT, AFSCME and CSEA.

The Board recessed to Closed Session at 9:05 p.m.

CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS TAKEN

President Miljanich announced that at the closed session just concluded, the Board took action to suspend an Instructional Aide.

ADJOURNMENT

It was moved by Trustee Holober and seconded by Trustee Schwarz to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried, all members voting Aye. The meeting was adjourned at 10:15 p.m. in memory of Dr. Jack Fiedler.

Submitted by

Ron Galatolo, Secretary

Approved and entered into the proceedings of the October 14, 2015 meeting.

Dave Mandelkern, Vice President-Clerk